

▶ **LABOUR-INT**
INTEGRATION OF MIGRANTS
AND REFUGEES IN THE LABOUR
MARKET THROUGH A MULTI-
STAKEHOLDER APPROACH

**EXPERT GROUP ON
SKILLS AND MIGRATION**

▶ **FINAL REPORT**

The LABOUR-INT project is implemented by a consortium jointly coordinated by ETUC, CEEP and EUROCHAMBRES, including a large range of partners around Europe, and with the involvement and support of several national, European and International organisations.

► PARTNERS



► SUPPORTING ORGANISATIONS



▶ CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION	4
1.1 Addressing the challenge: labour market integration of refugees and asylum-seekers	6
1.2 Goals and methodology of the Expert Group on Skills and Migration	8
1.3 The key challenges of transferability	9
2. A COMPREHENSIVE AND MULTI-STAKEHOLDER APPROACH TO LABOUR MARKET INTEGRATION	11
2.1 The labour market integration process	12
2.2 The role of economic and social partners	13
3. REVIEW AND ASSESSMENT OF SELECTED PRACTICES	15
4. KEY POLICY IMPLICATIONS	19
5. THE LABOUR-INT APPROACH	21
LIST OF REFERENCES	25
ANNEX 1	26

1. INTRODUCTION

As acknowledged in the policy and academic community, the cornerstone of migrants' integration process is their fair and successful integration in the labour market: the EU Common Basic Principles of Immigrant Integration state that "Employment is a key part of the integration process and is central to the participation of immigrants, to the contributions that immigrants make to the host society, and to making such contributions visible".¹ The recent upsurge of migration flows to Europe, consisting particularly of people seeking international protection, has made the need for effective and targeted integration policies ever more urgent. In the Action Plan for Integration of Third Country Nationals launched in June 2016² the European Commission (EC) pledged for more mainstreamed as well as targeted actions to support the integration in training, employment and society in general of recently arrived third country nationals, including refugees.

Regarding migrants' integration into the labour market, a special emphasis is placed on the importance of early identification and validation of skills and qualifications. Following the Communication on a New Skills Agenda for Europe,³ of June 2016, the European Commission developed a Skills Profile Tool to support early profiling of the skills of refugees, migrants and other third country nationals.⁴

In this context, even if the main work is to be done on the ground, the EU-level economic and social partners (ETUC, BUSINESSEUROPE, CEEP, UEAPME and EUROCHAMBRES) have already highlighted their readiness to support actions that will help to boost the labour market integration of migrants and refugees: at the Tripartite Social Summit of 16 March 2016 they presented a joint statement on the refugee crisis underlining their commitment and willingness to work with governments and other stakeholders to design and develop policies to support integration.⁵ The "LABOUR-INT: Labour Market Integration of Migrants: A multi-stakeholder approach" project represents a first concrete contribution in this direction.

This report represents the final output of the work carried out by the Expert Group on Skills and Migration (EGSM) of the LABOUR-INT project between April and September 2017. LABOUR-INT aims to promote multi-layered and multi-stakeholder integration paths for recently arrived migrants and refugees across the EU.

¹ The Common Basic Principles were adopted by the European Council in November 2004.

See <https://ec.europa.eu/migrant-integration/librarydoc/common-basic-principles-for-immigrant-integration-policy-in-the-eu>

² See <https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/what-we-do/policies/legal-migration/integration>

³ See Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the Council, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions A new skills agenda for Europe Working together to strengthen human capital, employability and competitiveness COM/2016/0381 final, <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX:52016DC0381>

⁴ See <http://ec.europa.eu/social/main.jsp?catId=1223&intPagId=5019&langId=en>

⁵ See https://www.etuc.org/sites/www.etuc.org/files/press-release/files/14.03.16_final_eco_soc_partners_message_refugee_crisis.pdf

On the one hand, the different stages of migrants and refugees labour market integration pathways are addressed in a comprehensive way, from their arrival up to the workplace, passing through education, vocational training and job placement. On the other hand, LABOUR-INT aims to establish an innovative approach, based on the cooperation, dialogue and commitment of the economic and social partners as key labour market actors, and to build or foster a fruitful collaboration with other relevant stakeholders both in the public, private and not-for-profit sector.

LABOUR-INT experiments such an innovative approach through the implementation of three pilot-actions in Belgium, Germany and Italy.⁶ In the context of the LABOUR-INT project, the EGSM had the task of capitalising on existing knowledge and expertise at EU and national level in order to prepare a level playing field for labour market integration of asylum seekers and refugees at all appropriate levels, from European to local.

The report is structured as follows: first, the target population is defined and the key challenges for integration are described (para. 1.1); then the specific goals and methodology adopted by the EGSM are presented in para. 1.2, including a short discussion on the need and feasibility of elaborating common solutions to a challenge that may take different forms in different contexts (para. 1.3). In section two the main features of the general approach are described, namely the multi-stage (para. 2.1) and multi-stakeholder (para. 2.2) nature of integration processes. A review of promising practices of integration recently developed by economic and social partners is presented in section three, followed by a short description of the main policy implications drawn by the review. Finally, a template for a general multi-stakeholder approach to labour market integration of international protection-seekers and beneficiaries (PSBs) is presented in section five.

⁶ The activities of the three pilot actions are starting or are still at an early implementation stage at the time of publication of this report. The Italian pilot action will be developed by the FISASCAT-CISL union (representing service workers) with ANOLF, a national association promoting integration and migrants' rights. It is aimed at screening, training and placing around 40 refugees living in the Milan area. The German pilot action is promoted by DGB Bildungswerk and AgenturQ (Agency for the promotion of vocational training in the metal- and electronics industry in Baden-Wuerttemberg) and it is aimed at developing the AiKomPass tool, an online tool for self-assessment of informally acquired competences, with a view to adapting it to refugees' skills. The Belgian pilot action is promoted by CEPAG (a Wallonia-based non-profit organisation) and aims at developing and testing a methodology for assessment and validation of refugees' skills as well as implementing a collaborative mapping with local businesses and chambers to identify skills in need and facilitate matching.

1.1

ADDRESSING THE CHALLENGE: LABOUR MARKET INTEGRATION OF REFUGEES AND ASYLUM-SEEKERS

During initial discussions within the EGSM, the experts and FIERI's representatives agreed to focus on humanitarian migrants as the main target of analysis and intervention. In this report the phrase "protection-seekers and beneficiaries" (PSBs) is used as a broad category including both asylum-seekers and beneficiaries of international protection (or of other forms of complementary protection as established by national legislations), provided they have legal entitlements to access the labour market, vocational training or employment support measures.⁷ Indeed, while the scope of the LABOUR-INT project is not limited to promoting the integration of this specific category of migrants, in this work the EGSM decided to adopt a more targeted approach. This choice was motivated by taking into consideration both the relevance and characteristics of this particular population in recent immigration waves, and the specific integration challenges PSBs faced at destination.

Indeed, since 2013, the EU has witnessed an unprecedented increase in new asylum claims: around 1.3 million new asylum applications were lodged, across Member States, in both 2015 and 2016, adding to the over 431,000 applications in 2013 and about 627,000 in 2014. The number of new applications recorded in 2015 was approximately double that observed in the EU-15 during the previous peak in the early 1990s. A large majority of newly arrived asylum-seekers have sought protection in Germany (around 60% of the total in 2016), Italy (10%), France (7%), Greece (4%) or Austria (3%), while other EU countries were considerably less affected, especially Eastern European or Baltic countries. The top-five origin countries in 2015-2016, covering 60% of total asylum applications, were Syria (27%), Afghanistan (15%), Iraq (10%), Pakistan and Nigeria (each with 4% of applications). Recently arrived asylum-seekers are predominantly young

men: nearly a third (32%) of first-time asylum applicants in 2016 were under 18 while 51% were aged between 18 and 34; around 16% of all under-18 applicants were unaccompanied minors. In 2016, nearly three quarter of new asylum applicants in the age group 14-34 were men (EUROSTAT, 2017).

Besides the mere quantitative relevance of this specific target population, the importance of focusing on protection seekers and beneficiaries is also related to the specific challenges that this group faces in integrating into the labour market and in society. As highlighted by academic and policy-oriented research, refugees and their accompanying families typically show less positive labour market performances if compared not just to native workers but also to other categories of immigrant workers (See BOX 1). Such challenges are related both to factors pertaining to specific characteristics of the refugee population (Supply-side) and to factors related with the business sector and individual employers (Demand-side). PSBs differ under several respects from other immigrant groups and this is reflected in different labour market integration patterns: looking at past refugee cohorts, PSBs tended to be, on average, older than other immigrant groups, lower educated and with a weaker command of host country language (European Commission, 2016, p. 114-115). Scant and mixed evidence exists on the education background of recently arrived PSBs, highlighting significant differences across origins and destination: a survey conducted by the International Organization for Migration (IOM) in Italy during 2016 on a sample of around one thousand PSBs hosted in the official reception system showed that a substantial share received no or little education (around 30%) while only 3.2% completed tertiary education (IOM-MPC, 2016). According to surveys conducted by the United Nations High

⁷ The label "Protection Seekers and Beneficiaries" encompasses different categories of humanitarian migrants with different legal entitlements attached to their status. Asylum (or protection) seekers are people who have formally lodged an asylum application, but whose claim is still pending. The directive 2013/33/EU laying down standards for the reception of applicants for international protection (Recast) states that asylum-seekers should be granted access to the labour market no later than 9 months from their application if a first instance decision has not been taken. However, there is still considerable variation among Member States regarding the time limits set in national legislation to grant access to the labour market for asylum-seekers. Beneficiaries of International Protection refers to both recognized refugees, satisfying the criteria set in the Geneva Convention of 1951 and in art.2 (letter d) of the Directive 2011/95/EU (Qualification Directive), and people that are granted a subsidiary protection based on criteria set in art. 2 (letter f) of the Directive. The EGSM has agreed to include within the broad category of PSB also those people that, although not recognized refugee status or subsidiary protection, are granted some form of humanitarian protection, where this possibility is foreseen by national legislation in Member States.

Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) among Syrian and Afghan PSBs on Greek islands, the latter hold a significantly poorer educational background compared to the former (UNHCR, 2016). Besides, refugees generally lack official documentation on their education credentials, which makes recognition in destination countries particularly difficult. PSBs may face specific vulnerabilities related to their physical or mental health. Given the circumstances of their migration they may lack connection with networks of co-nationals in host countries. Furthermore, PSBs may have a lesser likelihood of establishing long-term residence there, either because they may decide to return to their home countries when conditions determining their flight change, or because they are not granted protection at the end of their status determination procedure.

On the demand-side, while many employers see the opportunities of employing and/or training PSBs, they also face a variety of challenges in hiring or offering on-the-job training to this group of people (OECD, 2016b). Uncertainty

on the legal status of the PSBs and lack of information on the legislative framework on rights to employment and training may be a barrier. Access to information, the accompanying administrative paperwork, the need for housing and other practical arrangements are particularly challenging for small and medium enterprises. Employers may also face difficulties in the recognition of qualifications of PSBs or the validation of existing skills (including language skills), especially when formal documentation is lacking and valid systems of validation or certification are not available. Recruitment channels used by firms, for instance with posting vacancies online or through private employment agencies, are not the same used by PSB jobseekers who rely more on informal channels. The links between employers and local public employment services, NGOs or other third sector organisations that assist these job-seekers are usually weak. Furthermore, employers may need to adapt their HR policies, including training measures to manage an increasingly diverse workforce.

BOX 1. LABOUR MARKET PERFORMANCE OF REFUGEES

Past comparative research has showed that PSBs represent one of the most vulnerable groups on the labour market (Dumont et al, 2016). Qualifications or language skills of refugees compared to the needs and standards of national labour markets, on the one hand, as well as policy and legal framework in the host countries, on the other hand, contribute to explain existing gaps in labour market outcomes between refugees, on one side, and native or other immigrant workers on the other.

Recently, analysis based on the European Union Labour Force Survey (EU-LFS) 2014 ad-hoc module on migrant workers (which allows for identification of different immigrant groups by self-declared status upon entry) highlighted a significant disadvantage of past cohorts of refugee workers compared to natives as well as labour or family migrants across the EU. Whilst considering the parameters mentioned above, on average, refugees have lower employment rates, a greater likelihood of being in non-standard or in part-time employment, and, in some cases, they are overqualified for their jobs. They also have lower chances of finding a job if unemployed or inactive and face a greater risk of being undeclared workers. Notwithstanding substantial differences across EU countries, in 2014, on average, 56% of refugees were employed against 65% of the native-born workers and 71% of immigrants that entered for labour or study reasons (European Commission, 2016, p.119); besides, one in five economically active refugees were unemployed in 2014 (20%), more than half of them (60%) being unemployed for more than one year (Dumont et al, 2016). Among refugee workers, women display an even greater disadvantage in comparison with native or immigrant peers, as well as with refugee men: only 57% of refugee women are active in the labour market (against 77% of refugee men, 61% of other immigrant women and 66% of native-born women), while their employment rate is on average 45% and their unemployment rate is the highest among all groups (21%).

The refugees' disadvantage on the labour market may last for several years before they catch up with natives: on average, it takes refugees up to 20 years to have a similar employment rate as the native-born (Dumont et al, 2016, p. 22). In fact, the duration of stay is positively associated with improvement in language skills and employment prospects: the longer refugees live in the host country, the stronger is their command of the host country language, the better are their employment prospects.

1.2

▶ GOALS AND METHODOLOGY OF THE EXPERT GROUP ON SKILLS AND MIGRATION

Within the LABOUR-INT project, the EGSM aimed to pool knowledge and expertise in order to elaborate common solutions to PSBs' labour market integration challenge, with a specific focus on skills and qualifications. More specifically, the objective was to support economic and social partners in playing a more active and effective role in policies and practices supporting labour integration of PSBs, building on existing knowledge and drawing lessons from recent and promising experiences developed at local or national level. The expected outcome of the EGSM was the definition of an approach, to be adapted to national and local contexts, that could help economic and social partners to develop actions and strategies aimed to enhance labour market integration. Moreover, a more practical objective of the EGSM is to provide guidance for the implementation of the three LABOUR-INT pilot actions.

The work of the EGSM was led and coordinated by FIERI on behalf of the project's partners.⁸ FIERI's role was to propose a methodology, to collect and review some existing research and information about good practices of labour market integration, to elaborate the findings that are presented in this report, and, with the contribution of the EGSM experts, to outline the LABOUR-INT approach for the labour market integration of refugees. The EGSM has been composed of experts designated by and selected representatives of the partner organisations.⁹

The work of the EGSM has unfolded over six months, during which the Group has met twice. The objective of the first meeting, held on 9 May 2017 in Brussels, was to discuss the general goals, the methodology and the specific approach. On that occasion, the experts and FIERI agreed on a definition of the target population (i.e. PSBs, rather than the general migrant population); they discussed the cross-country differences within the EU and factors that could hamper the definition of common solutions; they outlined the key elements of the conceptual and theoretical approach that should inform the work of the EGSM; they defined the general methodology based on selection and assessment of some existing practices developed by economic and social partners across Europe. During the second meeting, held on 12 September 2017 in Brussels, the preliminary results and a first draft of the final report were presented and discussed. In between, the experts have exchanged ideas and information both at distance and on the occasion of other LABOUR-INT project meetings.

As agreed during the first meeting, the EGSM has initially carried out, through the experts' network, a scouting of relevant existing practices on PSBs' labour market integration with the objective of providing insights and ideas on how to strengthen the role of economic and social partners in this domain. Carrying out primary research on labour market integration policies and practices of economic and social partners was beyond the scope of the EGSM work. Therefore, the scouting exercise was not meant to produce a systematic and representative collection and analysis of all actions developed by economic and social partners across Europe.

⁸ LABOUR-INT project partners are: ETUC (project leader), CEEP, EUROCHAMBRES, DIESIS, FISASCAT-ANOLF, CEPAG, AGENTURQ, DGB BILDUNGSWERK, CITUB, FIERI, ITC-ILO. Several other International, European and national organizations also support the project. For more information see: <http://www.labour-int.eu/>

⁹ EGSM was composed by representatives of the following organizations: ETUC (European Trade Union Confederation); BusinessEurope (the Confederation of European Business), EUROCHAMBRES (the Association of European Chambers of Commerce and Industry), CEEP (the European Centre of Employers and Enterprises providing Public services), UEAPME (the European Association of Craft, Small and Medium-sized Enterprises) along with DIESIS (the European research and development service for the social economy), BDA (Bundesvereinigung der Deutschen Arbeitgeberverbände, the Confederation of German Employers' Association) and Cedefop.

During 2016 there was a rich production of review studies describing and discussing good practices of labour market integration for refugees (See Box 2). Nonetheless, the EGSM has acknowledged a significant knowledge gap concerning initiatives developed by or involving economic and social partners.

Some general criteria to identify the relevant practices were jointly defined within the EGSM. A first element of interest was to focus on practices **actively involving economic and social partners** either as initiators or as key

implementing partners of the initiative. Secondly, it was agreed to prioritize the collection of information about practices **addressing more than one or even all the main crucial stages of the labour market integration process** (see below). Finally, the primary geographical focus was on the three target countries of the LABOUR-INT project, namely Belgium, Germany and Italy (i.e. where the pilot actions were implemented), though practices from other EU countries were welcomed. Practices were identified both through desk-research and inputs coming from the experts' networks and partner organisations.

1.3



THE KEY CHALLENGES OF TRANSFERABILITY

The EGSM has discussed in depth the possibility and opportunity to elaborate common solutions – hypothetically applicable to all EU member states – to the challenge of PSBs' integration. EGSM's members agreed on the importance of paying due attention to crucial, contextual and structural factors which may impact the effectiveness of given policies and practices on the ground. Among such factors one should consider, amongst others, a) the size and specific characteristics of the PSB population in given countries and regions, in terms of origins, age structure, gender, skills and education profile, language proficiency etc.; b) each residence country's labour market structures and regulations; c) each residence country's institutional and regulatory framework concerning the labour market, industrial relations and social dialogue, education and vocational training systems, asylum policies etc.; d) the national qualification frameworks and validation mechanisms and tools; e) the specific role of economic and social partners in policy-making and implementation in each residence country; f) the locally prevalent forms of multi-level governance of integration and asylum policies; as well as g) the level and forms of public investments in integration policies.

Indeed, such contextual and structural factors are to be carefully taken into consideration both when assessing and evaluating a given policy or practice and when proposing specific shared solutions to the challenge: a look at the regulatory and institutional frameworks – viewed in a multilevel perspective – says a lot about the factors that may hinder or facilitate the success of a given action. A given policy or practice may be successful in one given context but hardly transferable in a different country or locality. Hence, transferability should not be taken for granted. Furthermore, policy evaluation in this field remains underdeveloped and fragmented (Martin et al., 2016), which does not allow for a thorough understanding on the actual impact of given actions and their strengths and weaknesses.

The EGSM therefore agreed to adopt an approach based on policy learning rather than policy transfer: when looking at promising integration practices one should consider that general ideas may be transferred but not administrative or technical solutions which are strongly grounded on specific policy environments. Therefore, it was agreed that the final outcome of the EGSM was the elaboration of a general approach, with guidelines to be adapted to concrete situations in each EU country.

BOX 2:**POLICY-ORIENTED RESEARCH ON LABOUR MARKET INTEGRATION POLICIES AND PRACTICES FOR PSBs**

The challenge of labour market integration of PSBs has attracted much attention following the developments of the refugee crisis since 2015. Several institutions and research centres have produced a number of policy-oriented papers analysing the realities on the grounds and producing relevant policy lessons that could inform future strategic interventions in this field. In January 2016 the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) issued its report “Making Integration Work” (OECD, 2016a), where it summarised the main challenges, presented good policy practices to support integration of PSBs and their families and outlined key policy lessons. The latter were summarised in ten recommendations:

1. Provide activation and integration services as soon as possible for humanitarian migrants and asylum seekers with high prospects of being allowed to stay;
2. Facilitate labour market access for asylum seekers with high prospects of being allowed to stay;
3. Factor employment prospects into dispersal policies;
4. Record and assess humanitarian migrants’ foreign qualifications, work experience and skills;
5. Take into account the growing diversity of humanitarian migrants and develop tailor-made approaches;
6. Identify mental and physical health issues early and provide adequate support;
7. Develop support programmes specific to unaccompanied minors who arrive past the age of compulsory schooling;
8. Build on civil society to integrate humanitarian migrants;
9. Promote equal access to integration services to humanitarian migrants across the country;
10. Acknowledge that the integration of very poorly educated humanitarian migrants requires long-term training and support.

Soon after the OECD study, the European Parliament published a report on the strategies and good practices of labour market integration for refugees, reviewing the available literature to identify the key elements of a successful integration strategy (Konle-Seidl and Bolits, 2016). In October 2016 the Migration Policy Centre of the European University Institute (Martin et al. 2016) published an extensive study on different types of labour market integration support measures for refugees (REFMISMES) in several EU countries: the report identified and discussed good practices and lessons learned in the different countries, as well as contextual factors influencing the effectiveness of different measures. Finally, in December 2016 the European Foundation for Improvement of Living and Working Conditions (EUROFOUND) published its report “Approaches to the labour market integration of refugees and asylum-seekers”, which included a discussion of the role and involvement of social partners in integration processes (EUROFOUND, 2016).

Besides these examples of policy-oriented research, strategic guidance was also provided by the International Labour Organisation (ILO) with the 34 ‘Guiding Principles’ adopted in July 2016 at the Tripartite Technical Meeting on the Access of Refugees and other Forcibly Displaced Persons to the Labour Market.*

* See: http://ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed_protect/@protrav/@migrant/documents/genericdocument/wcms_536440.pdf

2.



A COMPREHENSIVE AND MULTI-STAKE- HOLDER APPROACH TO LABOUR MARKET INTEGRATION

Within the framework of the EGSM, labour market integration is understood as a multi-stage and multi-stakeholder process. Indeed, a successful integration into jobs is the result of several stages through which a new labour market entrant should proceed: skills have first to be identified and assessed, then enhanced and strengthened, and finally matched with jobs available on the market.

Several actors, including economic and social partners, public authorities and agencies, NGOs or training institutions, have a crucial role to play in each of these stages. In particular, public authorities play a crucial role in the initial reception phase and in taking the first steps towards creating the appropriate conditions favouring the labour market integration of refugees. Economic and social partners also have a key role to play in this process, though the degree and form of their involvement vary across the EU depending (among other factors) on the salience of the issue in each member state and on the respective role in policy-making and policy implementation, according to the nationally prevalent characteristics of the industrial relations system and associated practices.

2.1

► THE LABOUR MARKET INTEGRATION PROCESS

The Expert Group has adopted a skills-based approach to labour market integration, which focuses on skills and competences, acquired in both formal and non-formal or informal contexts, as a key factor for boosting employability. This implied looking at three main stages of integration processes:

► **I. Skills assessment and profiling:** at first, skills and competences held by PSBs need to be identified and assessed, to make them visible and understandable by potential employers. While this may not be the case with other immigrant groups, refugees usually lack formal credentials and documentation about their education and/or working skills. In many cases they hold skills acquired in non-formal or informal contexts, for which specific validation and certification methods and tools are needed. The new Skills Profile Tool for Third Country Nationals recently launched by the European Commission¹⁰ is an example of such a tool which could represent a good starting point for presenting individual skills in a clear and concise way. It needs to be recognized, though, that additional job- or sector-specific assessment tools are often required. Economic and social partners may actively participate in this process by developing ad-hoc skills profiling tools (or developing new ones) by sector and/or occupation, often elaborating innovative solutions through IT tools.

► **II. Skills development:** when gaps are identified, they need to be filled with ad-hoc training and education pathways that include both basic training on language and civic education and vocational and professional training. Education and training need to be adapted to the individual profiles and aspirations of individual candidates, on the one hand, and based on a thorough and careful assessment of skills and labour needs in the local labour markets, on the other.

Participation in formal education or vocational training may be challenging since the education level of many PSBs is below that of the EU native-born and host country language(s) knowledge is scant not to say absent. Hence, alternative solutions favouring on-the-job training may be more adequate. In this regard, economic and social partners may contribute by promoting communication and awareness-raising campaigns among companies and firms on the possibility and opportunities to offer traineeships for PSBs. Besides, they may actively participate in the design of education and training courses to make them more tailored to the market needs.

► **III. Skills matching and placement:** once individuals have been trained they need specialised guidance and support to match their skills with jobs available in the market. Job intermediators and recruiters need specific competence when dealing with PSBs. This would include, for instance, a specific knowledge of the legal requirements concerning this specific category of workers; social skills necessary to work with people affected by psychological stress; ability to deal with people with a different cultural background. Once the access to workplaces is granted, PSBs (and people with a migrant background more in general) may need further individual support in order to adapt to the specific environments or elaborate future career plans. Individual firms and companies may need to adapt their HR policies, including training measures, to manage an increasingly diverse workforce. Economic and social partners may contribute by developing mentoring programs to facilitate integration into workplaces.

¹⁰ See <http://ec.europa.eu/social/main.jsp?langId=it&catId=88&eventId=1210>

2.2

▶ THE ROLE OF ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL PARTNERS

A successful labour market integration is typically the result of joint efforts and coordination from a variety of actors and stakeholders at local, regional, national and European level. Three main categories of stakeholders intervene and interact in this specific policy field: government bodies, including both central and local authorities and local public employment services; economic and social partners; civil society organisations (i.e. non-governmental and third sector organisations).

Economic and social partners are crucial actors in this process, though their role may vary depending (among else) on their relative role in policymaking and the specific industrial relations tradition, or on the salience of the issue in individual countries. A recent study by EUROFOUND has found a significant cross-country variation on the level and type of involvement of economic and social partners in refugee integration policies (See EUROFOUND, 2016). This ranges from no involvement at all; some involvement in the form of participation as external consultants and/or advisors; active involvement in policy design/policymaking at the national and/or regional level; or direct provision of services and measures (EUROFOUND 2016: 38-39). The specific role of economic and social partners may be distinguished in two main components: a political and societal role, which frames PSB integration into a general discourse on social cohesion and competitiveness; a more technical role which builds upon the development of concrete labour market policies through training and education, apprenticeships, information services etc.

Over the past months and years, economic and social partners have undertaken several initiatives in the field of refugee labour integration, both at European, national and local level. At the occasion of the Tripartite Social Summit of 16 March 2016, the European economic and social partners underlined “their commitment and willingness to work with governments and other stakeholders to

design and to develop policies to support inclusion.” They also called for a “Europe-wide solution involving all EU Member States, in a fair, balanced and responsible manner, factoring in skills analysis as well as national and regional economic needs”.¹¹ At national level, social partners actively participate in the political debate and contribute to orient public opinion on the issue of labour market integration. They can also engage in social dialogue with public authorities in order to address the challenge. In some cases, this has resulted in the conclusion of tripartite agreements or memorandum of understanding aimed at setting up specific initiatives to facilitate access to work.¹² Beside the political level, economic and social partners may give valuable contributions to integration process on the ground, within their respective role, capacities and interests as key labour market players. In particular:

Trade unions may play an important role in supporting the labour market integration of PSBs, mainly when it comes to defending the same working conditions and rights for native-born and foreign-born employees. The emphasis is usually put on the need to empower and educate workers on their rights, trying to secure them access to decent work. Indeed, unions are key players when it comes to advocacy and lobbying for the protection of all migrant workers (including refugees) and trainees rights; to provide information and support on labour rights and their violation to migrant workers; to guarantee equality of treatment between domestic and foreign workforce; to set up information and awareness-raising campaigns among its members; to develop anti-racism and anti-xenophobia education which may help alleviating social tensions and hostility towards PSBs and other immigrant groups.¹³

The involvement of employers’ organisations is also essential; they may support the process of skills validation and recognition of qualifications and provide information as well as administrative and practical support to employers

¹¹ See footnote 5 above. Other similar statements were released by sectoral organisations early before or after that occasion. See in particular the Joint EFFAT-HOTREC Position on the role of social partners in integrating refugees into labour market and society, by employers and unions in the hotel, restaurants and catering services sector (18 December 2015); The Joint Guidelines “Migration and strengthening anti-discrimination in local and regional governments”, by the Council of European Municipalities and Regions (CEMR) and the European Public Services Union (EPSU) adopted in September 2014 and updated on 5 December 2016; the Joint Declaration on the role of the private security sector in light of the increasing number of refugees in Europe, by UNI-Europa and the Confederation of European Security Services (CoESS) adopted in February 2016.

¹² For instance, this was the case with the Memorandum of Understanding signed by the main Italian confederation of employers, Confindustria, and the Ministry of Interior, which aimed at promoting access to traineeships for refugees hosted in local reception centres. Comprehensive tripartite agreements on integration were concluded in Denmark in April 2016 and in Norway in May 2016.

¹³ See Bergfeld, 2017 for an analysis of German Unions’ *Willkommenkultur* towards refugees

themselves – on, for example, the legal status and access of asylum seekers and refugees to employment. They may collaborate with Public Employment Services (PES) and private employment agencies to identify skills and labour needs that could be filled by refugee workers/trainees; promote and raise awareness among their members on the opportunity to employ this particular category; open up opportunities for in-work training and future employment; participate in the design and organisation of vocational training modules, validate skills acquired during the training experiences; promote the use of diversity management tools to make workplaces and companies more inclusive towards cultural diversity, etc. Several initiatives are already being developed, both at EU and national level, to promote the active participation of enterprises and employers' organizations in supporting integration efforts. It is worth mentioning, amongst others, the European Commission initiative "Employers Together for Integration",¹⁴ launched in May 2017, aimed at giving visibility to what employers are doing in the field of migrants' integration.

Finally, the Chambers of Commerce also play a key and hybrid role, especially in developing and upgrading skills. Not only do they represent businesses, the "users" of skills, but they also play a unique and pivotal role in skills development through the development and delivery of vocational education and training (VET) policy.

80% of all European Chambers of Commerce and Industry are involved in education and training and 48% of them deliver initial or continuous vocational education and training. Every year, nearly 1.8 million people receive training qualifications via the European Chamber network and 600,000 apprenticeships are managed directly by Chambers, mainly in Austria, France, Germany, Hungary, Luxembourg and Spain. Thanks to their peculiar nature, Chambers also play a key role in supporting labour integration of migrant and refugee groups; they may, for instance, provide technical assistance in skills assessment and validation schemes, provide VET, inform companies on the opportunities in hosting refugees, support companies in managing the administrative procedures, organise training and support for self-employment and migrant entrepreneurship, assist in the matching of company-refugees etc.

While economic and social partners have a pivotal role to play in this domain, it is vital that they interact and collaborate with other stakeholders to achieve the common goals. Such other stakeholders may be public authorities, educational institutions or PES, which oversee and organise reception and integration policies at the local level. But relevant actors are also NGOs and other third sector organisations, which in most cases are involved in the daily management of reception and integration services and are those that have direct contacts with people in need of support.

¹⁴ See https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/what-we-do/policies/legal-migration/european-dialogue-skills-and-migration/integration-pact_en

3.

▶ REVIEW AND ASSESSMENT OF SELECTED PRACTICES

The scouting exercise carried out by the EGSM has identified several successful or promising practices carried out in the EU and in Turkey with the aim of supporting the labour market integration of refugees and asylum seekers. As already noted, primary research and data collection was beyond the core tasks of the EGSM. The collection of good practices presented here is not meant to be a systematic review of the state-of-the-art of refugee integration practices by economic and social partners across Europe. Rather, it is intended to provide practical ideas and inspiration that could inform the development of a general multi-stakeholder approach to labour market integration of PSBs. Besides, the selected practices are expected to give insights on possible concrete solutions for specific aspects such as criteria for the selection of beneficiaries or characteristics of skills assessment tools. However, given the exploratory nature of the review of practices, the amount and type of information gathered does not allow a full and thorough description of all main aspects determining the degree of success of the individual practices.

A detailed description of the main elements of the individual practices can be found in the summary table in annex 1 to this report. Here a general assessment of the practices is presented, which is inspired by the conceptual approach defining labour market integration of PSBs as a multi-stage and multi-stakeholder process (See para. 2 above). Therefore, the individual practices were assessed through the lens of two key parameters: Comprehensiveness and Multi-Stakeholder approach.

► **1. Comprehensiveness** looks at the scope and reach of the given practice/initiative in terms of coverage of all relevant stages of labour inclusion: from the initial assessment of the skills and competencies for asylum-seekers and refugees to providing opportunities for further education and training (skills development) to support in skills matching and the final stage of placement.

► **2. 'Multi-stakeholder Approach'**, instead, looks at the partnership that designed and implemented the given practice, i.e. the type of actors involved and their respective contributions.

The key general assumption here is that, at least in abstract terms, policy interventions need to conceive the labour market inclusion process in a broad and extensive way, encompassing the key stages identified above. If beneficiaries of interventions have to be put into employment, all necessary actions have to be combined in a coherent and comprehensive way. Secondly, it is assumed that the active and balanced involvement of all relevant actors is critical in determining the success of a given policy action. Each actor has a valuable contribution to give, in its respective role and capacities, in facilitating and supporting labour market inclusion of PSBs.

Looking at the more general aspects concerning the sample of practices, it is no surprise that the larger number of practices has been identified in the top-destination countries of refugee flows over the recent years, namely Germany (IdA Bayern Turbo, Placements in transportation companies, Kausa, Exhibition for Refugees, BIFF, Valikom), Austria (TIK, Lehrlingscoaching, Mentoring for Migrants) or Sweden (Fast-Tracks); the others were identified in Belgium (Digital Training and Internships for Refugees, Refugees at Work, @Level2work, Refugee Crisis Task-Force), Denmark (IGU Scheme), Italy (Anabasi, Bipartite Agreement Confindustria-Ministry of Interior, Behind the threshold), Greece (Thematic Workshop) and Turkey (SIPRVET, Skills'10). There is a remarkable absence of practices from France, Netherlands or the UK (other major asylum destination countries), which may be due to the channels of selection of practices or possibly to the lesser involvement of economic and social partners in those countries.

The selected practices vary greatly in terms of size, resources allocated and target of the actions. In fact, the contexts where these practices have been developed differ largely depending both on the number and characteristics of PSBs in each country, as well as the relevant contextual factors such as the specific role and attributions of economic and social partners, the

level of public resources investment by central and local government authorities, the legal entitlements of PSBs as related to access to training or employment in the given countries. This is reflected in the remarkable differences among the selected practices: next to large-scale, nation-wide and publicly funded programmes (e.g. Fast-Tracks in Sweden or the IGU scheme in Denmark) there are small pilot projects implemented at local level with own resources or transnational projects developed with EU funds (European Integration Fund or the Erasmus + programme). Besides, not all the practices had PSBs as the main or principal target: while some were refugee-specific (e.g. FEB-VBO Refugee crisis task-force, Anabasi), others were oriented towards the migrant population more in general (e.g. Mentoring for Migrants, KAUSA). Furthermore, little information is available on the actual impact of the actions since most of the practices were still ongoing at the time of the survey and had recently started to be implemented.

When looking at the selected practices with the lens of the **Comprehensiveness** parameter, their content seems to reflect the consolidation of a "standard package" of intervention (consistently with the findings of Martín et al, 2016): assessment of skills and qualifications, followed by support and orientation for further basic and vocational training and support measures to get access to apprenticeships and jobs or further career guidance. However, only a few of the practices could intervene in all of these stages in a comprehensive way (e.g. Anabasi in Italy, Fast-Tracks in Sweden or IdA Bayern Turbo in Germany). In most cases they implemented actions in just one or two stages, either focusing on screening of skills and qualifications (e.g. TIK in Austria and VALIKOM in Germany) or offering general and vocational training to enhance skills and employability (e.g. SIPRVET and Skills'10 in Turkey or KAUSA in Germany) and helping matching skills with apprenticeships and jobs (e.g. Lehrlingscoaching and Mentoring for Migrants in Austria or BIFF in Germany). In at least one case (VALIKOM), the goal of the practice was to develop an innovative tool for the validation of non-formally and informally acquired vocational skills that could be applicable and comparable in the various German Chambers of Commerce.

When looking at the configuration of the **Multi-stakeholder approach** in given selected practices one can observe that the involvement of economic and social partners and of other relevant actors is highly variable and uncoordinated. In most cases practices were developed by several stakeholders cooperating on the basis of their respective roles and capacities. In the case of the IGU scheme in Denmark or the Fast-Tracks programme in

Sweden, for instance, the practice was built on a national tripartite agreement stimulated by the initiative of government agencies, which – following the strong social dialogue tradition in Scandinavian countries – sought the active collaboration of social partners in designing and implementing the integration measures. In some cases, local Chambers of Commerce and Industry played a crucial role as initiators of local projects, managing to set up networks with local business communities, PES and, in some cases, local NGOs and third sector organisations. (see for instance, Digital Training and Internships for Refugees in Belgium and Zukunftsmesse für Geflüchtete – Job-fair for Refugees or Valikom in Germany). In other cases,

instead, Chambers were key implementing partners (see Mentoring for Migrants and Lehrlingscoaching in Austria, the Action Plan for Syrians in Turkey). In the practices developed upon the initiative of trade unions, the partnerships often involved charities and NGOs or public agencies, but less frequently employers or Chambers (See Siprvet; Migrant Point EKA or AMIC-UGT). Employers were also active as initiators of integration practices, especially when it comes to offer training or jobs, in partnership with PES or other local actors (See BIFF, Placements for refugees in Public Transport Companies and IdA Bayern Turbo in Germany).

COMPREHENSIVENESS				
Practice (Country)	Skills assessment and profiling	Skills development and training	Skills matching and placement	Other support measures
Mentoring For Migrants (AT)			X	X
Lehrlingscoaching (AT)		X	X	X
TIK (AT)	X			X
@LEVEL2WORK (BE)		X	X	
Digital Training and Internships for Refugees (BE)		X		
FEB-VBO Refugee Crisis Task-Force (BE)				X
Refugees at Work (BE)			X	
1000 Placements in Local Transportation Companies (DE)	X	X		
BIFF (DE)			X	
Exhibition for Refugees (DE)			X	X
IDA Bayern Turbo (DE)	X	X	X	X
Kausa (DE)		X		X
Valikom (DE)	X			
IGU Scheme (DK)	X	X	X	
Thematic Workshops (EL)		X		
Anabasi (IT)	X	X	X	
Behind the Threshold (IT)		X		X
MoU on Traineeships (IT)		X	X	
Fast-Tracks (SE)	X	X	X	X
Siprvet (TK)		X		
SKILLS'10 (TK)		X		

MULTI-STAKEHOLDER APPROACH						
Practice (Country)	Employers	Trade Unions	Cham-bers of Com-merce	PES and Private employ-ment agencies	Public Authori-ties	NGOs and Train-ing Institu-tions
Mentoring for Migrants (AT)			X	X	X	
Lehrlingscoaching (AT)			x		X	
TIK (AT)			x		x	x
@LEVEL2WORK (BE)			X	X	X	X
Digital Training and Internships For Refugees (BE)	X		X	X		
FEB-VBO Refugee Crisis Task-Force (BE)	X			X	X	X
Refugees At Work (BE)			X	X		X
1000 Placements in Local Transportation Companies (DE)	X					X
BIFF (DE)	X		X	X	X	
Exhibition For Refugees (DE)			X	X		
IDA Bayern Turbo (DE)	X			X	X	X
Kausa (DE)			X			X
Valikom (DE)			X			X
IGU Scheme (DK)	X	X		X	X	
Thematic Workshops (EL)		X				X
Anabasi (IT)	X	X	X	X		X
Behind The Threshold (IT)			X		X	X
MoU On Traineeships (IT)	X				X	
Fast-Track (SE)	X	X		X	X	X
Siprvet (TK)		X				X
SKILLS'10 (TK)						

4.



KEY POLICY IMPLICATIONS

The review of recent policy-oriented research as well as of selected practices of labour market integration has highlighted the potential benefits of a multi-layered and multi-stakeholder approach. Based on the evidence presented above, it is possible to highlight some key policy implications that can inform future actions and interventions in a multi-level governance perspective, taking into account different labour market and industrial relations contexts and the extent to which PSBs are present in a given country.

- ▶ It is important to design measures that consider and possibly affect different stages of the inclusion process in a comprehensive and coherent way.
- ▶ Measures should be embedded in a long-term and societal development perspective, targeting the full integration of PSBs.
- ▶ To improve the effectiveness and efficiency of specific measures, all relevant actors need to be involved from the outset, including the policy design phase. For instance, when developing vocational training measures, it is important to take into consideration the specific national and local labour market situation, including up-to-date information on existing labour and skills shortages. Employers and Chambers are best placed to provide such information. The review and assessment of the selected practices suggests that the conclusion of memorandum of understandings among relevant actors or other forms of tripartite agreements at national, regional or local level, can help structure a multi-stakeholder approach.
- ▶ More innovative solutions are required to address some key technical aspects like, for instance, the selection of beneficiaries of interventions. At EU level, several steps are being taken, the main one being the rollout of the EU Skills Profile Tool which is being put at the disposal of Member States and which is to help draw a first general skills profile of the PSB. The tool is to be complemented by more specific tools which would allow for sector-specific skills profile to be drawn. Several of these tools are being or have been developed in Germany by public and private stakeholders and it would be worth investigating if and how these tools could be transferred to other countries.
- ▶ The training provided for beneficiaries (be it on-the-job training, professional training, VET, etc.) should be in line with national standards and lead to a formal validation/certification at the end, so that the beneficiaries can value them with potential employers.
- ▶ In the countries where the validation of skills acquired through VET and on-the-job training may pose challenges, it is important to check how far employers could be involved in the validation process: the validation of skills acquired through traineeships and work placements could help other potential employers to better understand a person's suitability for a particular job. A validation by former employer or hosting company would be helpful so that other potential employers can get an understanding of the experience and skills that a person brings. Here, IT tools may prove useful to enhance the portability of skills: electronic skills portfolios generated with Open Badge technology and compiled with the help of host companies may help former trainees to better utilize their skills on the job market (FIERI and Labnet, 2017).
- ▶ As for the selection process of beneficiaries: given the scarcity of resources available, it is important to identify general criteria to prioritize access for those in a better position to access the labour market swiftly and efficiently. For example, it could be decided to give priority to those national groups with greater chances of obtaining some form of protection and residence rights, and/or to those who possess a sufficient level of education and skills to enter the labour market. However, the criteria for the selection of beneficiaries should be necessarily adapted to specific national and local contexts, having regard for the characteristics of the PSBs population, the differing needs and entitlements for education and training, employment opportunities, the organisation of reception and integration services, among others.
- ▶ The type and amount of interventions developed so far is still highly heterogeneous across national and local contexts. Of course, differentiation depends on structural features and capacity which raise undeniable transferability issues. However, it would be helpful to provide opportunities for mutual learning and exchange of experiences among all the actors involved in multi-stakeholder approaches in the different EU countries. While it remains true that the size of the challenge and its articulation change significantly across member states, no country is totally immune and failure to integrate even low numbers of PSBs in the labour market may have serious and long-lasting social and economic consequences with negative effects for all. Umbrella organisations as well as the EU institutions may help to stimulate mutual learning by developing tools and peer-to-peer learning opportunities among their respective member organisations.
- ▶ While a deeper and more systematic involvement of economic and social partners is confirmed as an overall valid goal, there is a clear need for more primary research and in-depth evaluation of policies and practices developed to date.

5. ▶ THE LABOUR-INT APPROACH

As a concrete contribution towards the development of a multi-stakeholder approach, the EGSM proposes a template that can be used as a basis for action and a source for inspiration by economic and social partners, as well as other civil society organisations, with the goal of attaining the best possible successful integration of PSBs into the labour market. This approach will be articulated in the different stages which constitute the pathway to employment and will involve several stakeholders on the basis of their respective knowledge, interests and capacities which could complement each other to achieve the overall goal.

As a general rule, it is important that measures oriented to enhance labour market integration are built on a multi-stakeholder approach, involving all relevant stakeholders, namely employers' and workers' organisations, Chambers of commerce and industry, training institutions, public and private employment services, public authorities as well as managers of reception and integration services. Partnerships developed among such actors could cover, inter alia, the following aspects: the general goals, the type of actions to be undertaken, the forms of collaboration between the different stakeholders involved and their level of commitment. Actions could be presented in the form of agreements between economic and social partners, taking into account the national industrial relations environment and practices. Agreements could also be concluded between and with civil society organisations and public authorities.

Besides, the approach needs to take into consideration the main target groups for which measures are implemented: PSBs in the first place, but also potential employers (enterprises) and intermediaries.

The main steps in the process will be:

1. Selection of candidates (i.e. supply side).
2. Labour market needs and absorption capacity assessment (i.e. demand side).
3. Training and skills upgrading.
4. Placement.

For each step, specific tools and the actors in the best position to intervene are identified. In particular:

ACTIONS TARGETING PSBs, may comprise the following main steps:

- **a. Preselection of candidates:** Considering the differing situations in the EU Member States as to the numbers of PSBs present and the conditions under which they can participate in the local labour market, the EGSM believes that it is useful to identify a minimum number of criteria that could be widely used and that would allow stakeholders from different countries to do a reality check; and based on that reality check proceed with the integration of PSBs in the labour market. Such criteria could be, for instance: the beneficiaries' probability of being granted some form of international protection, their willingness to participate in the labour market, educational background etc. The willingness to find a job in the host country could be tested with a questionnaire the PSB has to complete. This questionnaire could also comprise elements for a psychological assessment when relevant for the type of employment, but in full respect of the dignity and privacy of the worker.

Tools: individual assistance by a qualified intermediary, questionnaires.

Actors: typically, relevant actors in this stage will be those involved in labour orientation processes (public/private employment agencies, Chambers, NGOs and managers of reception facilities, etc.)

- **b. Skills identification and first orientation process:** A first skills identification and assessment is to be done with PSBs as early as possible when the PSBs arrive in their country of settlement. This will lay the basis for further action in terms of training/employment.

Tools: personal guidance and electronic tools should be used whenever possible. The EC profiling tool would be a good starting point, as it allows for a very first mapping of the person's skills. At a second stage, more detailed tools, allowing for sector or occupation related skills to be tested and validated should be used in order to assess and recognize the individual's skills and determine the level of training needed in the relevant sector/occupation.

Actors: Public employment agencies, employers' organizations, trade union organizations, Chambers, other partners from the economic or academic world who can contribute to the process.

- **c. Basic training: Language, cultural, legal, general employment related:** PSBs should be prepared to access the labour market as soon as possible, based on the pre-selection process described above. A first phase of "pre-job" training would comprise language courses, also related to the technical language necessary in specific sectors/occupation; civic education courses, including key aspects of rights and duties for workers and job-seekers; and first level professional training.

Tools: personalised assistance, electronic tools, internet-based learning, classroom training.

Actors: a large range of actors can intervene at this stage from public training institutions to academia, to private training providers, as well as economic and social partners, or NGOs.

- **d. Job training:** after an initial professional training, PSBs access to traineeships or apprenticeships for on-the-job training should be greater. This could in turn lead to PSBs acquiring an official job title and ideally a job. In the case of on-the-job training, additional individualised support is often needed so that the chances for a smooth integration are enhanced. The on-the-job training should be implemented in accordance with the legal framework in place for professional training. It is essential that the results of on-the-job training are certified and therefore portable in order to enhance subsequent employability.

Tools: personalized assistance (e.g. coaching or mentoring), e-learning tools, classroom training, in-company training, internships, vocational education and training.

Actors: qualified actors (trainers, mentors) should be involved and activated, in line with the legal framework determining professional training in each country (In many countries Chambers in particular are playing an active role in this field).

- **e. Access to the labour market:** After the PSBs successfully conclude their training, it is assessed together with the enterprise whether the training can lead to a temporary or permanent job in the company where the training took place. In case the training cannot lead to a job in the enterprise, the PSBs are guided to the relevant employment services for further assistance (identifying employment opportunities in other enterprises).

Tools: Individual evaluation sessions

Actors: Counsellors (from Chambers, employers' organisations, trade unions, private counsellors, public employment agencies...)

ACTIONS TARGETING ENTERPRISES may comprise the following types of activities:

- **a. Mapping of labour and skills needs:** This step can be completed in different ways:

- Looking at local/regional/national employment forecasts,
- Looking at sector level skills and labour needs
- Surveying enterprises about their skills needs and asking them whether they could identify opportunities for offering traineeships, apprenticeships, work.

Tools: employment statistics, public employment offices, job vacancies, individual interviews with enterprises, ad-hoc surveys, etc.

Actors: Employers organisations, Chambers, trade unions, public employment offices

- **b. Identification of enterprises willing to employ PSBs and development of a network:** It will be useful to clearly identify enterprises which are in principle willing to employ PSBs and develop a network. Within that network, enterprises could exchange experiences and discuss common issues linked to the employment of refugees/migrants.

Tools: information sessions, individual contacts (via phone, mail, e-mail...), web based information, printed documentation, electronic networking platforms

Actors: Employers organisations, Chambers

- **c. Training and Counselling for enterprises about legal or workplace related aspects:** For the PSBs to become well integrated in the workplace, it is relevant to prepare the enterprise prior to their arrival. The preparation process will involve all enterprise levels, from the management over the employees' representatives (where applicable) to the staff. First of all, the legal aspects linked to employing PSBs should be explained/clarified. Besides the legal aspects, awareness should also be raised about the cultural background of the individuals joining the enterprise, particularly if they have been in the host country for a short while only and are not yet fully familiar with the local modus operandi. Raising awareness among enterprise staff about the cultural background of the refugees will also contribute to a better understanding of the situation and enhance the chances for exchange.

Tools: classroom training, in situ training, information sessions, individual and group discussions...

Actors: Chambers, employers' organisations, trade unions

- **d. Matching refugee/migrant and enterprise for training, internship:** This step is done based on the enterprise's needs analysis and the skills profile of the PSBs. The type of training is agreed on between the enterprise and the PSBs based on the former's needs and the latter's skills level and interest for the offered opportunity.

Tools: personal interviews, job fairs, matching events, counselling, mentoring...

Actors: Chambers, public employment agencies, employers' organisations, enterprise networks

- **e. Mentoring enterprises during the training process:** During the integration process, the enterprise might face difficulties with the PSBs due to the latter's cultural background and adaptation capacity. In that case, it will be good for both enterprise and PSBs to benefit from individualised mentoring in order to overcome the difficulties.

Tools: individual counselling (mentoring)

Actors: Counsellors from Chambers, employers' organisations, trade unions... trained in PSBs employment questions, in conflict resolution and diversity management.

ACTIONS TARGETING *INTERMEDIARIES*:

Two main categories of intermediaries for the LABOUR-INT approach are suggested considering: those who are active in the labour market preparation and are independent from the stakeholders of the LABOUR-INT project (i.e. public/private counsellors, NGOs...) and those inside enterprises.

It is difficult to define precisely the category of "independent" intermediaries as their nature/type will vary from country to country, as well as the type of intervention they offer during the integration chain. They should be closely associated to the integration process in order to maximise the opportunities for the PSBs to be successfully integrated into the labour market while taking into account the PSBs' skills and the local labour market needs. Intermediaries inside enterprises would typically be trade union representatives or specific counsellors (whether private or public) who would contribute to the successful integration of the target group into the labour market.

The steps indicated hereafter would apply to both categories.

- ▶ **a. Information and awareness raising about the specificities of the integration process:** Intermediaries should be made aware that they play a relevant role in the integration process, alongside the other actors. By offering adequate/inadequate advice to PSBs, they will contribute to shaping the success or failure of the integration process.

Tools: information sessions, web-based information, flyers, social media.

Actors: public authorities, employers' organisations, trade unions, Chambers.

- ▶ **b. Training to become familiar with the specificities (labour law, social, cultural specificities):** while "independent" intermediaries may already have a specialised expertise in supporting migrants and particularly PSBs integration, other intermediaries (e.g. companies' HR departments, temporary agencies staff, private recruitment agencies, etc.) may lack such knowledge and experience. Training will be needed in order to prepare them to deal with a culturally diverse workforce.

Tools: classroom training, web-based training.

Actors: public authorities, employers' organisations, trade unions, Chambers.

LIST OF REFERENCES

Bergfeld, M. (2017) *Germany's Willkommenskultur: Trade Unions, Refugees and Labour Market Integration*, Global Labour Journal, 8(1), 80-89.

Dumont, J.C., T. Liebig, J. Peschner, F. Tanay and T. Xenogiani, (2016) *How are refugees faring on the labour market in Europe? A first evaluation based on the 2014 EU Labour Force Survey ad hoc module*, OECD and European Commission, Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union.

EUROFOUND (2016) *Approaches to the labour market integration of refugees and asylum seekers*, Publications Office of the European Union, Luxembourg.

European Commission (2016) *Employment and Social Development in Europe 2016*, Directorate-General for Employment, Social Affairs and Inclusion, Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union.

EUROSTAT (2017) *Asylum Statistics*. Luxembourg: European Commission.

FIERI and LABNET (2017) "Towards the Global compact on regular migration: How to make migrants' skills more visible, portable and productive", Concept note prepared for the consultations for a "Global compact for safe, orderly and regular migration". <http://www.fieri.it/2017/10/03/verso-il-global-compact-sulla-migrazione-regolare-come-rendere-le-competenze-dei-migranti-piu-visibili-trasferibili-e-produttive/>

IOM, MPC-EUI (2016) *"Study on migrants' profiles drivers of migration and migratory trend. A research on the socioeconomic profile of migrants arriving in Italy"*, IOM Office for the Mediterranean, Rome. <http://www.italy.iom.int/sites/default/files/news-documents/Migrants%20Study%20-%20FINAL%20ENG%20VERSION%20-%20ELEC.pdf>.

Konle-Seidl, R. and Bolits, G. (2016), "Labour Market Integration Strategies of Refugees: Strategies and Good Practices", Study requested by the European Parliaments' Committee on Employment and Social Affairs, Directorate-General for Internal Policies, Policy Department A: Economic and Scientific Policy.

Martín, I., A. Arcarons, J. Aumüller, P. Bevelander, H. Emilsson, S. Kalantaryan, A. MacIver, I. Mara, G. Scalettari, A. Venturini, H. Vidovic, I. van der Welle, M. Windisch, R. Wolffberg and A. Zorlu (2016) *From Refugees to Workers: Mapping Labour Market Integration Support Measures for Asylum-Seekers and Refugees in EU Member States* (Vols. 1 and 2). Gütersloh, DE: Bertelsmann Stiftung.

OECD (2016a), *Making Integration Work: Refugees and others in need of protection*, OECD Publishing, Paris. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/9789264251236-en>

OECD (2016b) *"Hiring refugees - What are the opportunities and challenges for employers?"*, Migration Policy Debates, n° 10, September 2016 <https://www.oecd.org/els/mig/migration-policy-debates-10.pdf>

UNHCR, *Profiling of Syrian arrivals on Greek islands in January 2016, and Profiling of Afghan Arrivals on Greek Islands in January 2016*, <http://www.unhcr.org/news/briefing/2016/2/56cc4b876/unhcr-survey-finds-afghan-syrian-refugees-arriving-greece-fleeing-conflict.html>.

ANNEX 1

Practice Details	Integration aspects covered	Leadership & Partnership	Funding	Results
<p>Name: MENTORING FOR MIGRANTS</p> <p>Country & location: AT - Countrywide</p> <p>Time Period: 2008 – Open end</p> <p>Target population: Skilled migrants (NO Refugee-specific)</p>	<p>Skills development and matching</p> <p>Short Description: The core is the matching process: professional (e.g. industry, sector) or regional (e.g. companies target markets, mentee's origins) aspects are taken into consideration. The Mentoring Partnership: at the beginning, expectations and goals are set, the organizational framework is discussed etc. The partnership lasts for 6 months.</p>	<p>Austrian Economic Chambers (WKO),</p> <p>Austrian Integration Fund (ÖIF),</p> <p>Austrian Public Employment Service (Arbeitsmarktservice, AMS)</p>	<p>N.A:</p> <p>Source: Ministry of Science, Research and Economy (BMWFW) and the Austrian Federal Economic Chamber (WKÖ)</p>	<p>As of early July 2017, nearly 1.800 mentoring partnerships were successfully established</p>
<p>Name: LEHRLINGSCOACHING (<i>coaching for prospective apprentices</i>)</p> <p>Country & location: AT – Province of Tyrol</p> <p>Time Period: January 2017 – Open end</p> <p>Target population: Skilled migrants (NO Refugee-specific)</p>	<p>Skills profiling, development and matching</p> <p>Short Description: First, a selection of candidates is done based on language knowledge, digital skills, education background. A competence check is done through TIK-consultations (*see below). Candidates are prepared for apprenticeships through additional training, including language and civic education, math, English and IT courses and job interview training. An individual training plan is designed, based on a case-management approach. Coaches support both the candidate apprentices and the hosting companies.</p>	<p>Leader: Tiroler Soziale Dienste GmbH (TSD): charitable organisation under the ownership of the Province of Tyrol</p> <p>Partners: Austrian Economic Chambers (WKO)</p> <p>Local Public Employment Services and NGOs</p>	<p>N.A.</p> <p>Source: TSD Equity capital and donations; Austrian Economic Chambers and regional Management Tyrol</p>	<p>N.A.</p>

Practice Details	Integration aspects covered	Leadership & Partnership	Funding	Results
<p>Name: TIK (Tyrolean Integration Kompass)</p> <p>Country & location: AT – Province of Tyrol</p> <p>Time Period: Jan2017 – Open end</p> <p>Target: PSBs</p>	<p>Skills Assessment and Validation</p> <p>Short Description: A competence analysis is conducted either in group or individual consultations, through questionnaires in several languages. Those who completed this 1st phase, are assigned to TIK consulting for further individual counselling: interests, hobbies and job requirements, along with personal, social and professional skills are recorded using competence cards. All data is stored and printed on the Integration Kompass. Based on the Kompass, individual perspective plans are drawn up.</p>	<p>Leader: Tiroler Soziale Dienste <i>GmbH</i> (State-owned charity organization)</p> <p>Partner: Tyrolean Regional Government – Department of integration</p> <p><i>Other partners (local NGOs & social enterprises) were involved through a Task Force for the project (AG Integrationsstrategie für Flüchtlinge).</i></p>	<p>N.A.</p> <p>Source: (Local Government Funds)</p>	<p>As of mid-June 2017, 1,700 individuals completed a first skill assessment; 254 received the Integration Kompass</p>
<p>Name: @LEVEL2WORK</p> <p>Country & location: BE - West and East Flanders</p> <p>Time Period: April 2016 – March 2018</p> <p>Target: Recently arrived unemployed migrants (< 5 years in BE)</p>	<p>Skills development and matching</p> <p>Short Description: A physical and on-line one-stop-shop is set up to detect the target group and map their characteristics. The main target group is highly educated foreign jobseekers. Face-to-face and online individual career coaching is provided. Further training is offered focusing mainly on the acquisition of language skills. E-learning and a digital approach is favoured.</p>	<p>Agentschap Integratie-Inburgering (Agency for Integration and Citizenship)</p> <p>VIVES Hogeschool (School of Higher Education)</p> <p>Voka West-Vlaanderen (Chamber of Commerce and Industry West-Flanders)</p> <p>Randstad Group</p> <p>Cronos nv</p> <p>Netwerk Technical Staffing nv:</p>	<p>N.A.</p> <p>Source: European Social Fund</p>	<p>14 duos have been formed, of which 6 have the possibility to a job/activity (fixed employment, IBO, gain experience, consulting task, ...)</p>

Practice Details	Integration aspects covered	Leadership & Partnership	Funding	Results
<p>Name: DIGITAL TRAINING AND INTERNSHIPS FOR REFUGEES</p> <p>Country & location: BE - West-Flanders (Westhoek area)</p> <p>Time Period: May2016-Sept2016</p> <p>Target: PSBs</p>	<p>Skills development</p> <p>Short Description: A pilot project to train refugees and improve their digital skills. A "Digital Workshop" organised by Google (intensive and specialised training – 18hrs) <i>possibly</i> followed by short-term internship.</p>	<p>Voka West-Vlaanderen</p> <p>Adecco Group Belgium</p> <p>Google – Digital Workshop</p>	<p>N.A.</p> <p>Source: own funding</p>	<p>9 refugees participated in training, 2 of them concluded a traineeship (unpaid)</p>
<p>Name: FEB-VBO REFUGEE CRISIS TASK-FORCE (BE)</p> <p>Country & location: BE – Nation-wide</p> <p>Time Period: Sept 2015 – open end</p> <p>Target: PSBs</p>	<p>Other support measures</p> <p>Short Description: The Belgian confederation of employers has set up a task-force with representatives of businesses, sectoral organisations, public institutions and civil society organisations aimed at developing initiatives fostering the integration of PSB in Belgium</p>	<p>Leader: FEB-VBO (Federation of Enterprises in Belgium)</p> <p>Partners: several partners from sectoral employers' organisations, public institutions, employment agencies, NGOs</p>	<p>N.A.</p>	<p>A practical Guide on "Training and employing refugees and asylum-seekers" has been published in May 2017, providing detailed information on legal frameworks and existing support services and projects.</p>
<p>Name: REFUGEES AT WORK</p> <p>Country & location: BE – Province of West Flanders</p> <p>Time Period: 2016</p> <p>Target: PSBs</p>	<p>Skills Matching</p> <p>Short Description: Main activities include: a selection of local firms and potential candidates available for matching (done by local Employment agencies); field visits to specific workplaces are organised during "project days" (8 per year). During the same visits job applications may be presented.</p>	<p>VDAB (Flemish employment agency)</p> <p>Accent</p> <p>Voka West-Vlaanderen Local public centre for social welfare (OCMW)</p>	<p>N.A.</p>	<p>After 4 project days (out of 8): 28 local firms participate in the project; 320 candidates were selected, 51 of which are chosen; 28 have a job contract</p>

Practice Details	Integration aspects covered	Leadership & Partnership	Funding	Results
<p>Name: 1000 PLACEMENTS FOR REFUGEES IN PUBLIC TRANSPORT COMPANIES (* information provided only for the activities of BOGESTRA – Bochum area))</p> <p>Country & location: DE - Nationwide</p> <p>Time Period: June 2016 – Open end</p> <p>Target: PSBs</p>	<p>Skills profiling and development</p> <p>Short Description: All German public transport companies were encouraged to draw up their own integration plans fitting to the local contexts and companies' need. Bogestra worked together with local Job Centres and local faith-based charities to map and select candidates. Short-term internships (2 to 6 weeks) were offered at the transport company. Integration coach/mentors were identified.</p>	<p>VDV – Verband Deutscher Verkehrsunternehmen (German association of public transport companies)</p> <p>BOGESTRA (Public transportation company in Bochum)</p>	<p>No ad hoc funding</p>	<p>As of May 2017, 750 placements at national level; As for BOGESTRA alone: 17 internships, 2 resulting in apprenticeship contracts.</p>
<p>Name: BIFF (Berufliche Integration von Flüchtlingen in Frankfurt Rhein-Mein)</p> <p>Country & location: DE – Hesse (Frankfurt)</p> <p>Time Period: Late 2015 – ongoing</p> <p>Target: Immigrants and PSBs</p>	<p>Skills development</p> <p>Short description: A project developed by local employers, aimed at providing individual consulting about integration and qualification pathways, as well as offering access to entry-level jobs or apprenticeships</p>	<p>FRAPORT (initiator)</p> <p>Public and Private companies: Fraport AG, FES, Stadtwerke Holding, WISAG, Mainova, DACHSER, Fresenius; VGF</p> <p>Public institutions: Arbeitsagentur Frankfurt, Gesellschaft für Jugendbeschäftigung,</p> <p>IHK Frankfurt am Main</p>	<p>No ad hoc funding; contributions from each partner</p>	<p>140 orientated refugees in 2016 and 38 in employment or Vocational Training</p>
<p>Name: EXHIBITION FOR REFUGEES</p> <p>Country & location: DE – Frankfurt-am-Main region</p> <p>Time Period: December 7, 2017</p> <p>Target: PSBs</p>	<p>Skills matching</p> <p>Short Description: Organisation of a Job fair specifically addressing PSBs as perspective workers and trainees.</p>	<p>Leader: IHK Frankfurt (Local Chamber of Commerce and Industry)</p> <p>Partners: HWK (Chamber of crafts); Agentur für Arbeit Frankfurt; Jobcenter Frankfurt; FRAP-Agentur GmbH; Accenture Foundatio</p>	<p>N.A.</p> <p>Source: Own funding</p>	<p>56 employers participated in the Job Fair, 98% of them are highly satisfied and would attend again; 22 of them arranged job interviews (12 internships; 5 job positions; 5 other work-related programs)</p>

Practice Details	Integration aspects covered	Leadership & Partnership	Funding	Results
<p>Name: IDA BAYERN TURBO</p> <p>Country & location: DE - Bavaria</p> <p>Time Period: Jan 2016 – Feb 2017</p> <p>Target: PSBs (Aged 16-21)</p>	<p>Skills Development</p> <p>Short Description: Goal is to integrate round 1.000 PSBs with good permanent residence prospects into the German labour market (apprenticeship or occupation). Two stages: during max. 2 months, participants completed a general language course to bring their German language level to B1. The second stage entails work-related language courses, internships and reviews of their competencies. During the entire project special coaches provide support to the participants</p>	<p>Leader: Vereinigung der Bayerischen Wirtschaft (VBW) (Bavarian industry association)</p> <p>Partners: Bavarian Ministry for Labour and Social Affairs; Bavarian Public Employment Agency</p>	<p>VBW: 1.8 million €</p> <p>Bavarian PES: 5.3 million €</p> <p>Bavarian Ministry for Labour and Social Affairs: 0.8 million €</p>	<p>Out of 1,015 participants, 286 are in traineeship or entry level jobs, 299 had to drop out from the program due to relocation, illness, work-permit refusal or deportation (placement rate of 40%); around 850 companies participated in the programme</p>
<p>Name: KAUSA</p> <p>Country & location: DE - Stuttgart Region</p> <p>Time Period: Oct 2013 – Apr 2018</p> <p>Target: People with migrant background (* NO refugee specific)</p>	<p>Skills development and other support measures</p> <p>Short Description: It offers counselling on dual training, especially to self-employed workers, young people and parents from migrant backgrounds as well as young refugees. Aim is to support in exploiting opportunities in the vocational education and training system.</p>	<p>Chamber of Commerce and Industry – Stuttgart Region</p> <p>Vocational and training institutes; businesses, schools, migrant organisations.</p>	<p>N.A.</p> <p>Source: JOBSTARTER program, financed by Federal Ministry of Education and Research and the European Social Fund</p>	<p>Provided counselling to 500 refugees, 90 of them found training opportunities</p>

Practice Details	Integration aspects covered	Leadership & Partnership	Funding	Results
Name: VALIKOM Country & location: DE Time Period: Nov2015 – Oct2018 Target: N.A.	Skills Validation Short Description: ValiKom Project aims to develop a standardized and quality assured validation tool of non-formally and informally learned skills;	Westdeutscher Handwerkskammertag Several Local and Regional Chambers <i>Scientific monitoring and consulting:</i> Forschungsinstitut für Berufsbildung im Handwerk an der Universität zu Köln <i>Strategic Management and Communication:</i> Deutscher Handwerkskammertag; Deutscher Industrie- und Handelskammertag	N.A. Funding by Federal Ministry of Education and Research	Expected Results: a “chamber proved” concept for validating non-formally and informally acquired vocational skills including Practical guidelines with methods, criteria and standards for the chambers and assessors
Name: IGU SCHEME (DK) Country & location: Denmark – Nation-wide Time Period: Jan-Jun 2017 Target: PSBs	Skills profiling, development and matching Short description: The national government and social partners concluded a Tripartite agreement on labour market integration, which, in particular, introduced a new programme (Integration basic training, IGU) aimed at putting PSBs into short-term jobs at an apprentice salary level. The jobs can last for up to two years and refugees will also be offered skill development or education courses of up to 20 weeks. Fiscal incentives for employers are envisaged if the refugees are employed for two years.	National Government Danish Confederation of Trade Unions (LO) Confederation of Danish Employers (DA)	N.A.	N.A.

Practice Details	Integration aspects covered	Leadership & Partnership	Funding	Results
<p>Name: THEMATIC WORKSHOPS</p> <p>Country & location: Greece – Athens</p> <p>Time Period: Jan-Jun 2017</p> <p>Target: PSBs</p>	<p>Skills development and other support measures</p> <p>Short Description: Organisations of workshops and information sessions on issues related to integration of migrants, refugees and asylum-seekers in the Greek labour market, including labour rights, access to education, union membership etc. Specific attention to female refugees.</p>	<p>Leadership & Partnership</p> <p>Migrant Point EKA (Trade Union)</p> <p>Melissa Network (Migrant organisation, NGO); Mercy Corps; Greek Forum of Refugees</p>	<p>N.A.</p>	<p>Around 100 PSBs participated in workshops and information sessions.</p>
<p>Name: ANABASI</p> <p>Country & location: Italy – Turin</p> <p>Time Period: February 2016 – February 2017</p> <p>Target: PSBs</p>	<p>Skills assessment and development and matching</p> <p>Short Description: Activities include an initial language and civic education course (aimed at the acquisition of level A2), labour orientation activities and balance of competence (made by professional cultural mediators and labour consultants) and certified vocational training tailored on the specific needs of the labour market, in particular in the field of the shipbuilding industry.</p>	<p>Leader: QUANTA (Temp agency)</p> <p>Partners: CARITAS Municipality of Settimo; CNOS-FAP (Vocational Training Agency); Fondazione Comunità Solidale (Charity Trust)</p>	<p>500,000 € (Source: Forma. temp – a bipartite agency organising VET for temp agency workers)</p>	<p>80 pre-selected candidates offered counselling and skills assessment services; 57 participants in VET courses; 37 into employment.</p>

Practice Details	Integration aspects covered	Leadership & Partnership	Funding	Results
<p>Name: Behind the threshold</p> <p>Country & location: Italy (Milan and Genoa), Spain (Sevilla), Portugal and Belgium</p> <p>Time Period: 2011 - 2014</p> <p>Target population: Migrants (No refugee specific)</p>	<p>Skills development and other support measures</p> <p>Short description: Project activities included: training on entrepreneurial skills; financial and technical support for the start-up of the award-winning businesses; refresher and professional trainings; individual mentoring service for vocational training</p>	<p>Leader: Foundation ACRA CCS</p> <p>Partners: Formaper, (Chamber of Milan); CoLi.Do.Lat (migrant association); FAMSI - Fondo Andalus de Municipios para la Solidariedad Internacional; IMVF - Instituto Marques de Valle Flor; Fundacion Sevilla Acoge; Caad Belgique ASBL -Cellule Action d'Aide au Développement</p>	<p>NA</p> <p>Source: European Integration Fund</p>	<p>67 perspective migrant entrepreneurs trained; 63.5 hours of individualised assistance for the start-up of the three award-winning businesses; 540 hours of individual mentoring provided to 105 migrants.</p>
<p>Name: FAST-TRACKS (SE)</p> <p>Country & location: SE – Nation-wide</p> <p>Time Period: March 2015 - ongoing</p> <p>Target population: Newly arrived refugees with a residence permit.</p>	<p>Skills profiling, development and matching</p> <p>Short Description: The idea of national fast tracks for newly arrived refugees with skills needed on the labour market was initiated by the Swedish government and agreed upon with social partners through tripartite talks: FTs are carried out through a joint responsibility. Main goals are: to shorten time from arrival to work; to use skills in the right way; to match demand and supply side. Currently 14 FTs with 30 different professions.</p>	<p>Broad partnerships including National Government and other public agencies, with sectoral organisations.</p>	<p>Funding by Ministry of Employment</p>	<p>More than 3500 participants since the start.</p>

Practice Details	Integration aspects covered	Leadership & Partnership	Funding	Results
<p>Name: SIPRVET</p> <p>Country & location: TK – Gaziantep & Kilis regions</p> <p>Time Period: Sept2015 – Aug2017</p> <p>Target population: PSBs</p>	<p>Skills development</p> <p>Short Description: Project aimed at designing and testing of training modules for vocational and language education; beneficiaries included Syrian refugees in Turkey.</p>	<p>HAK-İŞ (Trade Union) Gazi University (TK), COJEP International (FR, NGO), HASENE (Germany/Turkey, Training institution)</p>	<p>Round 200,000EUR (incl. co-funding from consortium). Source: ERASMUS+ programme</p>	<p>20 refugees receive training in laundry and dishwashing activities</p>
<p>Name: SKILLS'10</p> <p>Country & location: TK – Pilot Regions</p> <p>Time Period: 2016 – ongoing</p> <p>Target population: Turkish people and Refugees</p>	<p>Other Support Measures</p> <p>Short Description: The main aim is to provide short courses for the unemployed in line with the skill needs of the labour market. It also focuses on capacity building at chambers for conducting effective labour market analyses, as well as for designing and implementing employment and VET policies.</p>	<p>TOBB (Union of Chambers and Commodity Exchanges of Turkey)</p> <p>Ministry of Labour and Social Security, Turkish Employment Agency, Ministry of National Education and TOBB University of Economics and Technology</p>	<p>N.A.</p>	<p>N.A.</p>

Report produced by Ester Salis and Ferruccio Pastore (FIERI)
October 2017

Co-funded by the Asylum,
Migration and Integration
Fund of the European Union.



This publication reflects only the views of the author, and the European Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained herein.



► **ETUC**
etuc@etuc.org
+32 (0)2 224 04 11



► **CEEP**
ceep@ceep.eu
+32 (0)2 219 27 98



► **EUROCHAMBRES**
eurochambres@eurochambres.eu
+32 (0)2 282 08 50